

**CITY OF BELLBROOK – SUGARCREEK TOWNSHIP
MERGER STUDY COMMISSION
STAFFING PLAN FOR PROPOSED MERGED GOVERNMENT
January 6, 2010**

Exhibit A

Part-Time Elected Officials

	City of Bellbrook	Sugar creek Township	Net Change	Total Merged Government
<u>Elected Officials</u>				
Mayor & City Council	7.00			7.00
Trustees		3.00	-3.00	0.00
Fiscal Officer		1.00	-1.00	0.00
<i>Total Elected Officials</i>	<i>7.00</i>	<i>4.00</i>	<i>-4.00</i>	<i>7.00</i>

Notes:

Italicized and bold numbers after entries indicate that a footnote follows.

1. The numbers shown for elected officials are so that the number of elected officials needed and recommended for elimination can be deduced. In reality, the elected officials are part-time, not full-time.

**CITY OF BELLBROOK – SUGARCREEK TOWNSHIP
MERGER STUDY COMMISSION
STAFFING PLAN FOR PROPOSED MERGED GOVERNMENT
January 6, 2010**

Exhibit B

Full-Time Equivalent Appointed Staff

	City of Bellbrook	Sugar creek Township	Net Change	Total Merged Government
<u>Administration</u>				
New City Manager ²			+1.00	1.00
City Manager/Finance Director	1.00		- 1.00	0.00
Township Administrator		1.00	- 1.00	0.00
Administrative Assistant		1.00		1.00
Executive Secretary		1.00		1.00
<i>Finance Director</i> ³			+1.00	1.00
Assistant Finance Director	1.00			1.00
Assistant to Fiscal Officer		0.40		0.40
Administrative Assistant –Finance	1.00			1.00
<i>Planning/Economic Development</i> ⁴				
Administrative Assistant – Zoning	1.00			1.00
Zoning Compliance Officer/Inspector		1.00	+1.00	2.00
<i>Human Resources Manager</i> ⁵			+1.00	1.00
Information Technology ⁶		1.00		1.00
<i>Legal</i> ⁷				0.00
<i>Engineering</i> ⁸				0.00

Full-Time Equivalent Staff

	City of Bellbrook	Sugarcreek Township	Net Change	Total Merged Government
Clerk of Council	0.28			0.28
Custodian	0.75			0.75
Museum Attendant	0.12			0.12
Camera Operator	0.01			0.01
<i>Total Administration</i>	5.16	5.40	2.00	12.56
Police⁹				
New Police Chief			+1.00	1.00
Police Chief	1.00	1.00	- 2.00	0.00
Assistant Police Chief			+1.00	1.00
Police Lieutenant	1.00	1.00		2.00
Police Sergeant	1.00	4.00		5.00
Police Sergeant Part-Time		0.50		0.50
Patrol Officer	9.00	12.00		21.00
Patrol Officer Part-Time	1.50	2.00		3.50
Administrative Assistant/Comm. Supv.	1.00			1.00
Dispatcher	4.00	5.00		9.00
Dispatcher Part-Time	1.00	0.50		1.50
<i>Total Police</i>	19.50	26.00	-0.00	45.50
Fire¹⁰				
New Fire Chief			+1.00	1.00
Fire Chief	0.79	1.00	- 1.79	0.00
Assistant Fire Chief		2.00	+1.00	3.00
Fire Captain	1.00	3.00		4.00
Administrative Assistant		0.50		0.50

Full-Time Equivalent Staff

	City of Bellbrook	Sugarcreek Township	Net Change	Total Merged Government
Fire Lieutenant	3.00	6.00		9.00
Firefighter/Paramedic	2.00	2.00		4.00
Part-Time Firefighter	3.00	8.25		11.25
Volunteer Firefighters (4)				
<i>Total Fire</i>	<i>9.79</i>	<i>22.75</i>	<i>0.21</i>	<i>32.75</i>
Service/Road & Bridge¹¹				
Public Works Director			+1.00	1.00
Service Superintendent	1.00		- 1.00	0.00
Director of Roads & Services		1.00	- 1.00	0.00
Service Administrative Assistant	1.00			1.00
Utility Billing Clerk	2.00			2.00
Service Foreman – Water	1.00			1.00
Service Foreman – Streets	1.00		+1.00	2.00
Road Supervisor		1.00		1.00
Maintenance/Service Workers	5.00	3.00	+4.00	12.00
Service Workers Part-Time		3.00		3.00
<i>Total Service/Road & Bridge</i>	<i>11.00</i>	<i>8.00</i>	<i>4.00</i>	<i>23.00</i>
Total Full-Time Equivalents	45.45	62.15	6.21	113.81

Notes:

Italicized and bold numbers after entries indicate that a footnote follows in the Staffing Plan Justification section.

**CITY OF BELLBROOK – SUGARCREEK TOWNSHIP
MERGER STUDY COMMISSION
PROPOSED MERGED GOVERNMENT STAFFING PLAN
January 6, 2010**

A. Ohio Revised Code

Sections 709.43 to 709.50 of the Ohio Revised Code cover local government mergers. Section 709.47 *Procedure after disapproval or approval* specifies what happens if a vote to merge is approved or disapproved.

If merger is disapproved:

No further petitions shall be filed under section 709.45 of the Ohio Revised Code proposing a merger of any of the territory in the proposed merger for at least three (3) years after the date of disapproval.

If merger is approved:

1. The merger is effective on January 1 of the year following certification of the results of the election unless the conditions specify a different date.
2. On and after the effective date of merger, the territory of Sugarcreek Township is annexed and included in the territory and corporate boundaries of the City of Bellbrook.
3. The form of government, ordinances, resolutions, and other rules of the City of Bellbrook will apply throughout the newly included territories to the extent that they are not in conflict with the conditions approved by the electors.
4. The Charter of the City of Bellbrook applies throughout the newly elected territories.
5. The corporate existence and the offices of Sugarcreek Township will terminate on the effective date of merger.
6. The City of Bellbrook will succeed to the following interests of both the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township:
 - a. All moneys, taxes, and special assessments; whether the moneys, taxes, or special assessments are in the treasury or in the process of collection;
 - b. All property and interests in property, whether real or personal;

- c. All rights and interests in contracts or in securities, bonds, notes, or other instruments;
 - d. All accounts receivable and rights of action;
 - e. All other matters not included in a. through e., above.
7. On and after the effective date of merger, the City of Bellbrook will be liable for all outstanding franchises, contracts, debts, and other legal claims, actions, and obligations of Sugarcreek Township.
8. The Board of County Commissioners of Greene County and the City Council of the City of Bellbrook shall negotiate an agreement requiring the County to continue providing within the previous unincorporated area of Sugarcreek Township for a determined period of time after the effective date of merger the County services it was providing to the unincorporated area of Sugarcreek Township prior to the effective date of merger.
9. During the negotiation process between the City of Bellbrook and Greene County, each of the following shall occur:
 - a. Before the merger's effective date, the Board of County Commissioners of Greene County and the City Council of the City of Bellbrook shall each create a proposed transition plan that addresses, among other potential issues for agreement between the County and the City, the following:
 - The period of time Greene County will continue to provide the County services to the former unincorporated area of Sugarcreek Township and the date upon which the City of Bellbrook will succeed to the County's responsibility of providing these services; and,
 - Payment by the City of Bellbrook to Greene County for the continued provision of the County services to the former unincorporated area of Sugarcreek Township during that period of time.
 - b. On the effective date of merger, the Board of County Commissioners of Greene County and the City Council of the City of Bellbrook shall exchange their proposed transition plans.
 - c. Within thirty (30) days after the effective date of merger, the Board of County Commissioners of Greene County and the City Council of the City of Bellbrook shall meet to discuss the proposed transition plans and shall create a compromise transition plan that addresses, among other potential issues for agreement between the County and the City, the issues listed in 6., above.

- d. Within sixty (60) days after the date of the meeting between the Board of County Commissioners of Greene County and the City Council of the City of Bellbrook, the Board and the City Council shall agree on a compromise transition plan.

B. Staffing Plan

In light of the above provisions of the Ohio Revised Code, we have prepared two Staffing Plans for the proposed newly merged government. The proposed Staffing Plan for part-time Elected Officials is shown in **Exhibit A**. The proposed Staffing Plan for full-time Appointed Officials is shown in **Exhibit B**.

Exhibit A shows that there are currently seven (7) elected Mayor and City Council members in the City of Bellbrook and three (3) elected Trustees in Sugarcreek Township. These ten (10) elected officials serve as the respective governing boards of the two jurisdictions. *We are recommending the elimination of three (3) of these elected officials in the proposed merged government.*

Exhibit A also shows that there is currently one (1) elected Fiscal Officer in Sugarcreek Township. *We are recommending the elimination of this position in the proposed merged government and, as described below, we are recommending the appointment of a full-time Finance Director in the proposed merged government.*

Exhibit B shows that there are currently 45.45 full-time equivalent (FTE) staff in the City of Bellbrook and 62.15 FTE staff in Sugarcreek. The combined appointed staff in the two jurisdictions is currently 107.60 FTE. *We are recommending the addition of 6.21 FTE staff in the proposed merged government.* The justification of these recommended additional positions is explained below.

Although not part of the Staffing Plan, per se, we have also shown estimates for one-time and continuing costs following approval of a proposed merged government as best they can be determined at this time.

C. Staffing Plan Justification

The following justification for the number and types of personnel to be included in the proposed merged government is provided. *Numbers in bold italics correspond to the same numbers on the Staffing Plan (**Exhibits A and B**).*

Overall Staffing Perspective

Our findings indicate that staffing levels in both the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township are lean as compared with other jurisdictions where similar studies have been conducted. This observation is based on over thirty (30) years of extensive

management consulting assignments with local governments across the United States performed by our senior staff. Therefore, the proposed merger of the two (2) governmental entities will not save large amounts of expenditures through the elimination of duplicate or excessive staff. Moreover, staffing will need to be added or contracted for to provide those services/perform those functions currently provided in Sugarcreek Township by Greene County that will become the responsibility of the proposed merged government.

Specific Staffing Comments/Justification

1. The size of the governing body in the City of Bellbrook is currently seven (7) and in Sugarcreek Township is three (3). Only one (1) governing body will be needed in the proposed merged government.

According to the ***2002 Census of Governments***, there are 35,933 sub-county general purpose local governments in the United States, including 19,429 municipal governments and 16,504 town or township governments. Only twenty (20) states located in the Northeast and Midwest have township governments. Ohio has 3,636 local governments including 942 municipalities and 1,308 townships. All have governing bodies of one size or another. Some local governments are full-service in nature; some offer limited services.

There are no generally accepted nationally recognized standards for numbers of members of governing bodies for local governments.

Ranges in the size of governing bodies are from one (1) to fifty (50) plus depending on state laws, form of local government, charters and local preference. Some governing body members are compensated for their time and expenses, some just for expenses and some receive no compensation. Terms of office vary, but most serve four (4) year terms on a staggered basis and some serve two (2) year terms on a staggered basis. A few are all elected at the same time. The trend in recent years has been to have a combination of district and at-large seats. More communities in recent years have chosen to have a mayor elected at-large for a term as opposed to being chosen by the members of the governing body. Increasingly, there are office term limits for governing board members.

Some communities have elected to change the size of their local governing bodies and sometimes their form of government in order to adjust to what they perceive will work best in their particular situation and time.

The Council-Manager form of government continues to be the popular choice of most communities in Ohio and around the country because of its professionalism. Most states including Ohio provide for local government Home Rule Charters, while a few states are Dillon Rule states, meaning the local government is required to obtain permission from the state government or commonwealth prior to taking certain types of actions.

Our recommendation is to have the governing body for the proposed merged government be of the size of seven (7) members. This recommendation is based on research that we have conducted on governance issues over the years in Ohio and across the country.

Local government governing bodies of seven (7) members tend to be able to provide sufficient individual perspectives of members so that issues that they deal with can and do receive a sufficient evaluation and discussion prior to decisions being made. Governing bodies of less than seven (7) members sometimes do not have sufficient individual perspectives to air issues effectively. Governing bodies with more than seven (7) members often begin to break down into factions which reduces the effectiveness of the governing body. Also, an odd number of members on a governing body provides the opportunity to break ties when votes are cast. Further, seven (7) members on a governing body provides greater opportunities to sufficiently discuss issues in the event that some members may be absent from meetings.

There is a total number of appointed staff in the two jurisdictions, as follows:

45.45 in City of Bellbrook.

62.15 in Sugarcreek Township.

107.60 Total

There is very little duplication of staff that will become redundant in a proposed merged government.

There are no generally accepted nationally recognized standards for total size of local government appointed staff by local government population size. Generally, local governments are staffed to deliver the services that they are responsible for providing, the frequency of those services and the level of those services as decided by the governing body representing citizens of the jurisdiction.

The ***International Personnel Management Association for Human Resources (IPMA-HR)*** conducted a selected nationwide ***Benchmarking Study of a Number of Local Government Employees - Less Than 100 Employees*** in May, 2001. This study addressed several factors. One was the average number of employees for a local government of 15,000 population or less. Below are the results*:

Under 50 person workforce – 20 percent of the responses indicated that the total workforce (full-time, part-time, temporary or contingent employees and contractors) was less than 50 persons.

Between 50 and 99 person workforce – 80 percent of the responses.

City of Bellbrook current workforce – 45.45 FTE persons (7,009 population).

Sugarcreek Township current workforce – 62.15 FTE persons (8,000 population)

Proposed Merged Government workforce – 113.81 FTE persons (15,009 population).

* Care should be exercised in interpreting this data in that it was collected eight (8) years ago, the local governments surveyed by IMPA may have offered different services as compared to the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township and the size of the sample was fairly small. However, the data does provide an order of magnitude comparison to the City of Bellbrook, Sugarcreek Township and the proposed merged government.

2.& 3. The current City Manager of the City of Bellbrook also has the dual responsibility of Finance Director.

The only generally accepted national staffing standard for City Managers (and it is more of a rule-of-thumb that is not written down) is that when a community gets to be of a certain size and complexity, the City Manager of that community typically is a full-time City Manager and does not have responsibility for other functions unless the local Charter so states. For example, many City Managers in Ohio by local Charter are also the Public Safety Directors of that community even though there is a full-time police chief and full-time fire chief. Middletown, Ohio is an example of that. In most cases, however, this is more a title than a position with regular duties and responsibilities to be carried out.

As mentioned earlier, the City of Bellbrook City Manager currently has the dual responsibility of City Finance Director.

There will likely be a large number of both city management and finance related issues that may require two people to be responsible for those functions in the proposed merged government.

There are no generally accepted national standards for staffing of a Finance function in local government. Staffing is generally done based on State law, the functions and duties to be performed, the need to comply with generally accepted accounting principles, the regularity of functions and duties to be performed and local needs.

Sugarcreek Township currently has a part-time Fiscal Officer and this position is recommended by our firm to be eliminated in a merged government. The elimination of the Fiscal Officer position may be reason enough to justify adding a full-time Finance Director to the proposed merged government because of the high importance of this function to the newly merged government. In addition, based upon our experience and research with other governmental mergers, we believe that there will be a sufficient number of financial, financial management and budgeting issues which will occur

resulting from the proposed merger that will justify the provision of a full-time Finance Director for the merged government. ***Therefore, we believe that a full-time Finance Director should be added to the proposed merged local government.***

4. Greene County currently provides a number of planning and zoning services to Sugarcreek Township. This may no longer be the case in a merged government depending on how the merged government elects to perform these services after the transition period. The options for providing this service are as follows:

- By contract with Greene County;
- By contract with an urban planning firm or individual with the appropriate expertise to provide the needed services;
- By contracting with another local government to provide the services; or,
- By staffing up to provide the needed services in-house.

There are no generally accepted national standards for staffing of a planning and zoning function in local government. Staffing is generally done based on development issues in the community, on the functions and duties to be performed, the frequency of those functions and duties and local needs.

In some local governments, planning, zoning, building, code enforcement and economic development functions are all together in one department. This may be the type of model to follow in the proposed merged government.

There will be considerable work required to merge the Sugarcreek Township Planning and Zoning Ordinances into a municipal-type function. In addition, storm water and floodplain management functions are not currently under the purview of the Sugarcreek Township Planning and Zoning function. Therefore, we believe that additional training and staff will be required to properly oversee these functions in order to comply with regulatory requirements. One Zoning Compliance Officer/Inspector will need to be added to the merged government to provide these added functions. ***Therefore, we believe that a full-time Zoning/Compliance Officer/Inspector should be added to the proposed merged local government.***

5. Neither the City of Bellbrook nor Sugarcreek Township currently has a Human Resources function on a full-time basis. This work is currently performed on a part-time basis by various staff which has other assigned duties.

There are no generally accepted national standards for staffing of a human resources function in local government. Staffing is generally done based on the functions and duties to be performed, the frequency of those functions and duties and local needs.

Based upon our experience and research with other governmental mergers, a number of issues will likely exist in the areas of employee classifications and compensation, labor agreements, union issues, hours worked, overtime, employee evaluations, performance measures and related human resources issues. We believe that these issues will justify the

adding of a full-time Human Resources Manager to the merged government. ***Therefore, we believe that a full-time Human Resources Manager should be added to the proposed merged local government.***

6. The City of Bellbrook does not have an individual fully dedicated to performing the IT function for the City. This is currently the part-time responsibility of the Service Director. Sugarcreek Township does have a full-time IT Supervisor responsible for IT functions for the Township.

There are no generally accepted national standards for staffing of an IT function in local government. Staffing is generally done based on the amount of current or desired automation, the functions and duties to be performed, the desire to perform all or part of the function in-house or by contract or both, the frequency of those functions and duties and local needs.

With added responsibility in the proposed merged government, the current Service Director of the City of Bellbrook will likely not have time to perform some of the IT functions that he is currently performing on a part-time basis.

Based upon our experience with other mergers and merger studies over the years, we believe that at least one full-time IT person can be justified in a merged government. A large number of complex and existing IT hardware, systems, software, networks and the like in both jurisdictions will need to be made compatible or changed in a merged government. We believe that there are several ways that this work can be accomplished in a merged government. These are:

By contract with an IT firm or individual with the appropriate expertise to provide the needed services;

By staffing up to provide the needed services in-house; or,

By contracting with Greene County or another local government to provide the needed services.

Because of the rapid changes in technology and software systems and the need to stay abreast of those changes, we recommend that the proposed merged local government contract with an IT firm or individual with the appropriate expertise to provide the needed IT services.

7. The City of Bellbrook currently obtains legal services from an outside individual attorney who charges for his actual time. Legal services are also procured from various other law firms for more complex legal matters such as personnel and zoning. In recent years, the City has spent less than \$15,000 per annum with these other law firms. The City does not have a contract with any law firm.

Under the statutory form of township government in Ohio, the Greene County Prosecutor provides legal services to Sugarcreek Township. However, sometimes the legal counsel needed is more specialized. Sugarcreek Township also utilizes the services

of the law firm of Downes, Fischel, Hass & Kimm in Columbus, OH for personnel related issues. Their hourly rate is \$175. For annexation and some zoning related legal issues and matters, the Township utilizes the services of the firm Frost Brown Todd from West Chester, OH. Their hourly rate is \$225. Other legal counsel is provided through the liability insurance provider on a case-by-case basis. Most of that legal counsel is provided by the firm of Surdyk, Dowd & Turner from Dayton, OH.

There are no generally accepted national standards for staffing of a Law Director Office or legal function in local government. Staffing is generally done based on workload, the functions to be performed, the frequency of those functions and local needs. In smaller jurisdictions the prevalent practice for providing legal services is by purchasing them by the hour or under contract from:

A competent local attorney or law firm; or,
From another local government.

Because of the flexibility afforded from an established law firm or established local attorney, we recommend that the proposed merged local government contract with a law firm or with a competent local attorney with the appropriate expertise to provide the needed legal services.

8. Engineering Services to the City of Bellbrook are currently provided by LJB, Inc. LJB provides day-to-day engineering support for the City on a variety of issues such as storm water management, the water system and other infrastructure. In addition, LJB has been the engineer for the City on a number of specific projects. The City has entered into a Master Rate Agreement with LJB, but does not have a contract per se, except on specific projects.

Engineering services to Sugarcreek Township are currently provided by the Greene County Engineer.

There are no generally accepted national standards for staffing of an engineering function in local government. Staffing is generally done based on the amount and frequency of community development or redevelopment (or, in some cases, community decline), number and types of projects, workload, functions to be performed, the frequency of those functions and local needs. In smaller jurisdictions the prevalent practice for providing engineering services is by purchasing them by the hour or under contract from:

A competent local engineer or engineering firm; or,
From another local government.

In almost all local governments, all or portions of design engineering work is contracted to an outside engineering firm, whether in a stable or a growing community.

One argument for having at least one engineer on staff is so that plans, maps, drawings, diagrams, records, etc. can be maintained by that individual and plan review can be done on-site. This may be something that the proposed merged local government wants to work towards.

Because of the flexibility afforded from an established engineering firm or competent local civil engineer, we recommend that the proposed merged local government contract with an engineering firm or with a competent local civil engineer with the appropriate expertise to provide the needed engineering services.

10. With the elimination of one Police Chief and the virtual doubling of the size of the Police Department, additional leadership and management of the Department will be needed.

Therefore, we recommend that a new position of Assistant Police Chief be added to the proposed merged government.

There are no generally accepted national standards for the number of police officers per capita or per 1000 citizens. Most of the “so called” standards that have been developed or attempted have been prepared by labor unions or other officials to justify local staffing and have not been found to be applicable nationally. Most police chiefs, city and county managers and management consultants agree that a community must first be consulted to determine the level and type of service expectations and must make a determination of how much they are willing to pay for those expectations to be met. With that understanding in hand, programs, time availability, staffing, training, facilities, equipment, etc. can be matched to local expectations.

Many communities do have goals for sworn police officers per 1,000 population served. These goals do not appear to include the full-time equivalent impact of reserve officers, where used. From some of our past recent studies of other police departments and a brief telephone survey conducted for this report a sample of goals is shown below:

1.10 sworn police officers per 1000 population in an under 10,000 population town in VT.

1.50 sworn police officers per 1000 population in a 30,000 population upper middle-end suburban community in the Minneapolis-St. Paul, MN area.

2.00 sworn police officers per 1000 population in a 50,000 population high-end Atlanta, GA suburb.

2.20 sworn police officers per 1000 population in an under 10,000 population city in VT.

2.50 sworn police officers per 1000 population in a 4,000 population very high-end suburb of Detroit.

In none of the above cases were staffing goals set as a standard, but the staff goals evolved over time through budgetary decisions on the number of officers required to

meet community expectations. The goals, therefore, were derived after years of local police department staffing decisions had been made.

The Commission on Accreditation for Law Enforcement Agencies, Inc. (CALEA) Standard 16.1.2 states: “The agency allocates personnel to, and distributes them within, all organizational components in accordance with documented workload assessments conducted at least once every three years.” This standard is the only specific reference to staffing levels in the CALEA Standards Manual. Not every local government law enforcement agency has been accredited by CALEA as it is a rigorous and often expensive process. The City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township Police Departments have not been accredited by CALEA.

The *International City/County Management Association (ICMA) The Municipal Yearbook, 2007* (for 2006 data – latest available) shows the following average staffing levels per 1000 population:

2.04 average sworn police officers per 1000 population – national average for all police departments reporting.

2.12 average sworn police officers per 1000 population - national group of municipalities in the population range of 10,000 to 24,999.

1.41 average sworn police officers per 1000 population in the group of municipalities in the East North Central Region, of which the State of Ohio is a part.

By comparison, the June 2008 *Comprehensive Analysis of the Financial Impacts of a Potential Merger between Washington Township and Centerville City in Montgomery County, Ohio* conducted by the Urban Affairs Center of The University of Toledo (FY 2005 data) showed:

1.90 sworn police officers per 1000 population in Centerville, OH.

1.50 sworn officers per 1000 population in Washington Township, OH (Contract with Montgomery County Sheriff’s Office).

The FY 2009 data for the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township and in the proposed merged government is as follows:

1.93 sworn police officers per 1000 population in Bellbrook.

2.56 sworn police officers per 1000 population in Sugarcreek Township.

2.27 sworn police offers per 1000 population in the proposed merged government.

The data for the City of Bellbrook compares favorably with the survey data. Sugarcreek Township data is somewhat high compared with the average survey data, but the Township is large geographically making service delivery more difficult and the Police Department staffing is reflective of what the Township Trustees have elected to provide based on their views of the desires of Township citizens.

According to the ICMA Municipal Yearbook, 2007 (for 2006 data – latest available, the average annual per capita cost of a police department is as follows:**

\$219.71 – national average per capita annual cost of a police department.

\$216.81 – average annual cost of a police department in the national group of municipalities in the range of 10,000 to 24,999 population.

\$218.81 – average annual cost of a police department in the East North Central Region, of which the State of Ohio is a part.

** It should be noted that the total departmental expenditures in the ICMA survey data include municipal contributions to retirement, social security and insurance.

By comparison, the June 2008 *Comprehensive Analysis of the Financial Impacts of a Potential Merger between Washington Township and Centerville City in Montgomery County, Ohio* conducted by the Urban Affairs Center of The University of Toledo showed the average per capita cost of providing police services as follows:

\$265.49 – FY 2007 in Centerville, OH.

\$110.70 – FY 2007 in Washington Township, OH (Contract with Montgomery County Sheriff's Office).

The FY 2009 data on annual per capita cost of the police departments for the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township and in the proposed merged government is as follows:***

\$206.89 – City of Bellbrook.

\$303.75 – Sugarcreek Township.

\$285.52 – Proposed merged government.

*** The comparison of figures should be made with some degree of caution in that the 2006 year of the ICMA data doesn't directly compare with FY 2009 numbers from the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township, but they give an order of magnitude comparison. It should also be noted that the budgetary figures for the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township do include municipal contributions to retirement, social security and insurance and are comparable to the ICMA data in that regard. Further, it should be noted that the cost of the Emergency Communications Center in Sugarcreek Township is split between the Fire and Police Departments and the Police portion of that budget is included in the per capita cost of \$303.75, above.

Again, the data for the City of Bellbrook compares favorably with the survey data. Sugarcreek Township data is somewhat high compared with the average survey data, but the Township is large geographically making service delivery more difficult. Also, the

Police Department staffing is reflective of what the Township Trustees have elected to provide based on their views of the desires of Township citizens.

Comparisons of Police Officer/Citizen ratios are as follows:

1:519 – FY 2009 data, City of Bellbrook.

1:390 – FY 2009 data, Sugarcreek Township.

1:441 – Proposed merged government.

1:539 – FY 2005 data from the University of Toledo study, Centerville, OH.

1:952 – FY 2005 data from University of Toledo study, Washington Township, OH (Contract with Montgomery County Sheriff's Office).

Still again, the data for the City of Bellbrook compares favorably with the survey data. Sugarcreek Township data is somewhat high compared with the average survey data, but the Township is large geographically making service delivery more difficult. Also, the Police Department staffing is reflective of what the Township Trustees have elected to provide based on their views of the desires of Township citizens.

According to the ICMA Municipal Yearbook, 2007 (for 2006 data – latest available), the mean number of sworn police officers per local government is as follows:

33.0 – nationally in communities of 10,000 to 24,999 population.

13.5 – FY 2009 data, City of Bellbrook +

20.5 – FY 2009 data, Sugarcreek Township =

34.0 – FY 2009 data, proposed merged government.

The number of sworn police officers that would be present in the proposed merged government compares favorably with the ICMA national survey data.

10. With the elimination of one Fire Chief and the virtual doubling of the size of the Fire Department, additional leadership and management of the Department will be needed.

We recommend that a new position of Assistant Fire Chief may be added to the proposed merged government.

There are three (3) generally accepted national staffing measures (not standards) for the fire service. One (1) measure compares the number of fire personnel per 1000 population; one (1) measure and prescribes minimum staffing per apparatus; and, one (1) measure compares the total cost of a fire department per capita.

Some additional ones that have been developed or attempted have been prepared by labor unions or other officials to justify local staffing and are not applicable nationally.

One generally accepted measure is that the number of fire personnel per 1000 population should generally be less than for the number of sworn police officers per 1000 population.

The *International City/County Management Association (ICMA) The Municipal Yearbook, 2007* (for 2006 data – latest available) shows the following national average of full-time paid fire personnel per 1000 population:

1.65 – national average of full-time paid personnel per 1000 population.

1.68 – national average of full-time paid personnel per 1000 population in the national group of municipalities in the population range of 10,000 to 24,999.

1.53 – average of full-time paid personnel per 1000 population in the municipalities in the East North Central Region, of which Ohio is a part.

The FY 2009 data for the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township and in the proposed merged government is as follows:*****

0.97 – FY 2009 full-time paid fire personnel per 1000 population in the City of Bellbrook.

1.75 – FY 2009 full-time paid fire personnel per 1000 population for Sugarcreek Township.

1.45 – FY 2009 full-time paid fire personnel per 1000 population in the proposed merged government.

***** Both jurisdictions make use of part-time and volunteer firefighters to augment their full-time personnel.

The data for the City of Bellbrook compares favorably with the survey data. Sugarcreek Township data is somewhat high compared with the average survey data, but the Township is large geographically making service delivery more difficult. Also, the Fire Department staffing is reflective of what the Township Trustees have elected to provide based on their views of the desires of Township citizens.

It has been our experience that communities seldom specifically set staffing standards per 1000 residents.

The *National Fire Protection Association (NFPA)* has developed and issued *NFPA Standard 1710* in 2001 after ten (10) years of research and debate, a standard that sets minimum criteria for the effectiveness and efficiency of emergency operations to protect the safety of the public and Fire Department employees. *NFPA Standard 1710* requirements include the following:

Firefighters will respond with a minimum of four (4) personnel on each apparatus.

Firefighters will arrive at the emergency scene within four (4) minutes of the dispatch center receiving the call.

The correct number of fully staffed and strategically located fire stations must exist to accomplish the standard.

NFPA Standard 1710 covers staffing for career fire departments and NFPA Standard 1720 covers staffing for departments with volunteers. Staffing is to be “sufficient to perform necessary operations” with the Fire Department “to define minimum staffing levels.” Further definitions of these standards include the following requirements:

Advance Life Support (ALS) Ambulance: Two (2) Paramedics and two (2) EMTs (likely in two (2) units).

Engine Company: Minimum of four (4) on-duty; (five (5) or six (6) in communities in more complex or hazardous situations).

Ladder Company: Minimum of four (4) on duty; (five (5) or six (6) in communities with more complex or hazardous situations).

Many communities set staffing standards for engine and ladder companies, as well as for ambulances. Some of these standards are stated in union agreements. The trend is to define optimal and minimum staffing for units as follows:

Ambulances: One (1) Paramedic and one (1) EMT minimum, with a second (2nd) preferred. If a First Responder (non-Paramedic) unit, two (2) EMTs.

Engine Company: Optimal staffing of four (4) and minimum staffing of three (3). In smaller communities, the third (3rd) and fourth (4th) could be the Chief and/or Assistant Chief.

Ladder Company: Optimal staffing of four (4) and minimum staffing of three (3). In smaller communities, the third (3rd) and fourth (4th) could be the Chief and/or an Assistant Chief.

Overall Fire Department staffing levels, oftentimes, are determined by adding together the staff needed for the number of companies and shifts covered, management and administration, fire protection, training and the like to reach a total budgeted personnel count.

According to the ICMA Municipal Yearbook, 2007 (for 2006 data – latest available) national average minimum crew size per local government fire apparatus is (or would be) as follows:

- 3.1 – for pumpers.
- 2.9 – for ladders.
- 2.4 – for rescue units (includes ambulances).

In the national group of municipalities in the population range of 10,000 to 24,999, the average minimum crew size per fire apparatus is as follows:

- 3.0 – for pumpers.
- 2.7 – for ladders.
- 2.5 – for rescue units (includes ambulances).

For the East North Central Region municipalities, of which Ohio is a part, the average minimum crew size per fire apparatus is as follows:

- 3.1 – for pumpers.
- 2.8 – for ladders.
- 2.5 – for rescue units (includes ambulances).

For FY 2009 the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township and in the proposed merged government, the average minimum crew size per fire apparatus is as follows:

City of Bellbrook:

- 3.0 – for pumpers.
- 3.0 – for ladders
- 2.0 – for rescue units (includes ambulances).

Sugarcreek Township:

- 3.0 – for pumpers.
- 3.0 – for ladders
- 3.0 – for rescue units (includes ambulances).

Proposed Merged Government:

- 3.0 – for pumpers.
- 3.0 – for ladders
- 2.5 – for rescue units (includes ambulances).

The data for the City of Bellbrook, for Sugarcreek Township and for the proposed merged government compares favorably with the survey data.

According to the ICMA Municipal Yearbook, 2007 (for 2006 data – latest available) the average annual per capita cost of local government fire departments is as follows:

- \$149.01*** – national average per capita cost of fire departments.
- \$148.11*** – average per capita cost of fire departments in the national group of municipalities in the population range of 10,000 to 24,999.
- \$150.41*** – average per capita cost of fire departments in municipalities in the East North Central Region, of which Ohio is a part.

By comparison, the June 2008 *Comprehensive Analysis of the Financial Impacts of a Potential Merger between Washington Township and Centerville City in Montgomery County, Ohio* conducted by the Urban Affairs Center of The University of Toledo showed that Washington Township provided fire department services to both Washington Township and to the City of Centerville. The average per capita cost of fire services being provided is as follows:

\$143.00 – FY 2007 data, City of Centerville, OH.

\$143.00 – FY 2007 data, Washington Township, OH.

The FY 2009 data for the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township and in the proposed merged government is as follows:#

\$119.19 – average per capita cost of the Fire Department in the City of Bellbrook.
\$222.50 – average per capita cost of the Fire Department in Sugarcreek Township.

\$174.25 – average per capita cost of the Fire Department in the proposed merged government. (Assuming no changes are made expenditure-wise).

These figures are approximate in that the years of the ICMA data don't directly compare with FY 2009 numbers, but they give an order of magnitude of comparison. It should also be noted that the ICMA average per capita cost data includes retirement and medical costs and those are also included in the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township figures. Further, it should be noted that the cost of the Emergency Communications Center is split between the Sugarcreek Township Fire and Police Departments and the Fire portion of that budget is included in the per capita cost of \$222.50.

The data for the City of Bellbrook compares favorably with the survey data. Sugarcreek Township data is somewhat high compared with the average survey data, but the Township is large geographically making service delivery more difficult. Also, the Fire Department expenditures per capita are reflective of what the Township Trustees have elected to provide based on their views of the desires of Township citizens.

The FY 2009 full-time Fire Officer/Citizen Ratio in the City of Bellbrook, Sugarcreek Township and the proposed merged government is as follows:

1:701 – City of Bellbrook.

1:533 – Sugarcreek Township.

1:600 – proposed merged government.

As mentioned earlier, typically, local government police departments are staffed with higher ratios of sworn officers per capita than are fire departments. Comparisons of Police Officer/Citizen ratios are as follows:

- I:519** – FY 2009 data, City of Bellbrook.
- I:390** – FY 2009 data, Sugarcreek Township.
- I:441** – Proposed merged government.

As you can see from the above data, the full-time Police Officer/Citizen Ratio is higher than the Fire Officer/Citizen Ratio in the City of Bellbrook, in Sugarcreek Township and in the proposed merged government.

Compliance with NFPA Standards:

Under its current City of Bellbrook Fire Department staffing plan, the City of Bellbrook can only meet the ***NFPA 1710 and 1720 Standards*** through the utilization of Automatic Mutual Aid Response (AMAR). This creates a fine line of compliance with variables such as closest mutual aid availability, turn-out time and travel/traffic issues. The City’s response matrix shows how it includes a multi-agency response to most calls of significance within the City. The additional units are automatically called via radios in the mutual aid agency’s dispatch center on the initial dispatch, thus not waiting until the City Fire Department learns that it has a “working fire” to try and catch up on meeting the standards. On a typical day, the City Fire Department believes it could not meet any of the NFPA staffing standards without the assistance it receives from the AMAR program.

Additionally, the City of Bellbrook Fire Department has policies in place for compliance with ***NFPA 1500 Safety Standards*** regarding the “Two in – Two out” rule, Air Management of first in crews, Accountability and additional “ Initial Rapid Intervention Companies” or IRIC.

Sugarcreek Township regularly complies with ***NFPA Standard 1720*** and meets ***NFPA Standard 1710*** thirty (30) to forty (40) percent of the time. Much depends on the time of day, the staffing strength of the Fire Department and the volunteers.

The International Standards Organization (ISO) Public Protection Classification Program rates the fire protection systems in communities on a scale of 1-10, with a classification of 1 being the most preferred rating.

The ISO rating for the City of Bellbrook is currently a three (3). The ISO rating for Sugarcreek Township is currently a four (4) in hydranted areas and a nine (9) in non-hydranted areas. The lower the rating, to some degree, the lower the fire insurance premiums paid by homeowners and businesses on structures in the community. (Care should be exercised in making judgments from these ratings in that they are based on the fire services available in a particular jurisdiction and the factors involved are often complex). In a proposed merged government, ISO would need to reevaluate the ISO rating for the newly merged government.

The City of Bellbrook had its most recent evaluation by ISO in 2008. The City exceeded most of the ISO average standards for a municipal/suburban fire department. The evaluation included a comprehensive evaluation of the City's Communications Center, Water System and fire suppression capabilities.

Sugarcreek Township Fire Department does not meet ISO Standards 100 percent at any time.

11. Although some communities have made an effort to benchmark measurements such as "average lane miles of road maintained by one (1) Maintenance/Service Worker", there are no generally accepted standards for staffing of a Public Works or Service Department in local government.

Street Departments in suburban communities seldom have staffing standards per 1000 population or lane-mile. One (1) exception to this is that some county Highway Departments assign staff as follows:

1.00 – road worker to anywhere from ***twelve (12) to fifteen (15) miles of rural two-lane roads***. These workers, however, are also utilized to form larger crews for crack-filling, chip-sealing and the like.

Instead, Street Department staffing tends to build up based on budget decisions over time. In addition, Street Department staff may be assigned to non-streets activities where workload is not directly related to lane miles, such as:

- Grounds maintenance for public buildings.
- Sidewalk repair and maintenance.
- Snow removal in parking areas.
- Street sweeping in selected areas.
- Traffic signs and signals.
- Water Department functions (as in City of Bellbrook).

The American Public Works Association (APWA) has promulgated many standards, most of which are related to materials, work processes, work procedures, etc. They also publish a ***Public Works Management Practices Manual***, which supports self-assessment and accreditation programs for its members. The manual focuses on Public Works-related functions and activities, as well as management practices, management systems and controls and resource management. The manual does not provide guidance on determining staffing levels or on staffing standards.

The City of Bellbrook currently employs the following Service Department Staff (beyond the Service Superintendent):

- 1.00*** – Service Foreman for Water
- 1.00*** – Service Foreman for Streets
- 5.00*** – Maintenance/Service Workers

These personnel maintain:

- 90.00** – lane miles of street and related street duties, plus to maintain:
- 40.50** – miles of water lines and related pumping stations and equipment. This equates to:
- 12.86** – lane miles of street and:
- 5.79** – miles of water lines and related pumping stations and equipment per Maintenance/Service Worker/Foreman.

Sugarcreek Township currently employs (beyond the Director Road & Bridge):

- 3.00** – full-time Maintenance/Service Workers.
- 3.00** – FTE part-time Maintenance/Service Workers.

All Maintenance/Service Workers have responsibility for maintaining, along with other duties:

- 49.01** – miles of public road (2008 numbers) in the Township.

This equates to:

- 6.00** – Maintenance/Service Workers.
- 49.01** – miles of road to maintain currently.
- 8.17** – approximate miles of road/Maintenance/Service Worker (+ other duties).

The merged government will be taking maintenance responsibility for an additional:

- 33.94** – miles of public road.
- 26.00** – bridges and structures.

The maintenance of additional public road in the merged government will necessitate the addition of at least:

- 4.15** – additional Maintenance/Service Workers (***33.94 miles of public road/8.17 miles of road per Maintenance/Service Worker = 4.15 personnel***).

In addition, the proposed merged government will be taking on additional responsibility for maintaining **26 bridges and structures. This will justify adding at least four (4) additional Maintenance/Service Workers in the proposed merged government.**

The FY 2009 budget for the Road & Bridge Department for Sugarcreek Township is:

- \$850,000** – Departmental budget. Most of this budget is for road maintenance within the Township. The Department is responsible for maintaining:

49.01 – miles of road annually, this means that each mile of road maintenance costs approximately:

\$17,343 – annually to maintain (without bridges, but budget includes other tasks).

Information obtained from the Greene County Engineer stated that the Greene County Engineer's Office currently maintains:

324 – miles of road and:

285 – bridges throughout Greene County. The Engineer has a staff of:

26.00 – Maintenance/Service Workers.

3.00 – Foremen.

1.00 – Highway Superintendent.

1.00 – Sign Department Manager to do the work associated with the various roads and bridges in the County.

9.00 – office staff that has duties that range from survey and design work to inspection of bridges to administrative support work.

40.00 – total staff assigned to roads and bridges.

The total cost of labor with fringes for the County Engineer's Office road and bridge operation is approximately:

\$3 million annually – this equates to:

\$9,259 annually – per mile of road maintained (with bridges included).

\$75,000 each staff member – \$3 million/40 staff = \$75,000 each (this figure is approximate in that most of the staff are Maintenance/Service Workers and a few are office and field workers. Also, this figure includes training, fringe benefits, equipment, materials, supplies, tools, gear, etc.).

The total cost of the Engineering Department in Greene County is approximately **\$6.5 million annually**.

Three hundred twenty four (324) miles of road and two hundred eighty five (285) bridges/31 staff assigned = 10.45 miles of road and 91.9 bridges/staff member. In addition, each of those 31 staff has support from the nine (9) administrative staff in the office.

The County Engineer estimates that it would take three (3) to four (4) additional Maintenance/Service Workers plus one (1) additional administrative person to maintain the additional 33.94 miles of road and 26 bridges and structures in Sugar creek Township that would become the responsibility of the proposed merged government.

We are recommending the elimination in the proposed merged government of the current Director Roads & Bridge position that currently exists in Sugar creek Township.

We also recommend the adding of one (1) additional Service Foreman – Streets in the proposed merged government.

We believe that whether the proposed merged government staffs up to maintain the additional miles of road and the additional bridges and structures now maintained by Greene County, that this position will be needed. In the instance of contracting with Greene County to provide these services, the new Service Foreman – Streets would be more of a contract and quality control manager over the County contract. If the proposed merged government elects to staff up to provide these services, this individual would be a supervisor of Maintenance/Service Workers.

We believe that the proposed merged government will be better off financially over time to staff up to provide the additional needed road and bridge maintenance.

D. Summary

In summary, we believe the current elected and appointed official staffing of the City of Bellbrook and Sugarcreek Township to be justified based on what the elected officials and citizens of the two jurisdictions have approved and funded over time.

As for the proposed merged government, we recommend the following relative to staffing:

1. That the **3.00 part-time elected Trustees** positions currently in Sugarcreek Township identified in **Exhibit A** be eliminated as duplicative on the date the merger becomes effective; that ***the size of the governing body for the proposed merged government be seven (7) in number.***
2. That the **1.00 part-time Fiscal Officer** position currently in Sugarcreek Township identified in **Exhibit A** be eliminated on the date the merger becomes effective.
3. That the following **7.79 FTE appointed staff** positions identified in **Exhibit B** be eliminated as duplicative on the date the merger becomes effective. These appointed staff positions are identified as follows:

1.00 – City of Bellbrook City Manager/Finance Director
1.00 – Sugarcreek Township Administrator
1.00 – City of Bellbrook Police Chief.
1.00 – Sugarcreek Township Police Chief.
0.79 – City of Bellbrook Fire Chief.
1.00 – Sugarcreek Township Fire Chief
1.00 – City of Bellbrook Service Director
1.00 – Sugarcreek Township Director of Roads & Services.

7.79 Total

4. That the following appointed staff positions be added to the proposed merged government on the date the merger becomes effective:

- 1.00* – New City Manager
- 1.00* – New Finance Director
- 1.00* – New Zoning Compliance Officer/Inspector
- 1.00* – New Human Resources Manager
- 1.00* – New Police Chief
- 1.00* – New Assistant Police Chief
- 1.00* – New Fire Chief
- 1.00* – New Assistant Fire Chief
- 1.00* – New Public Works Director
- 1.00* – New Service Foreman – Streets
- 4.00* – New Maintenance/Service Workers

14.00 Total

This will provide a net increase of:

6.21 – recommended staff positions in the proposed merged government.

5. That no additional staffing decisions be made until after completion of the Transition Period of the proposed merged government as required by Ohio Revised Statutes.
6. That a practice of contracting with Greene County or other local governments, contracting with the private sector, staffing up internally or combinations of the above, be implemented for adding additional staff capacity that will likely be needed in the proposed merged government. This staffing or capability is as follows:

- IT assistance@
- Legal assistance@
- Engineering assistance@
- Additional accounting assistance@

@ These services, in our professional opinion and based on other mergers that we have studied, will in all likelihood be required for the proposed merged government to function most effectively.

7. Some of these services may be more one-time in nature in order to fully merge the systems, ordinances, resolutions, policies, etc., of the two jurisdictions together. Others will be on-going as responsibility of provision of the service/function is transferred from Greene County to the proposed merged government. These staffing-related services/functions to be

provided in the proposed merged government with their estimated cost are shown below:

Estimated Annual Savings from Elimination of Duplicate Personnel

Township Trustees (3)	\$ 84,000
Township Fiscal Officer	34,000
City Manager/Finance Director	110,000
Township Administrator	103,000
Police Chief (2)	190,000
Fire Chief (2)	160,000
Service Director	90,000
Director, Road & Bridge	<u>80,000</u>
Total	\$851,000

One-Time Staffing-Related Cost Estimates

Additional legal services	\$ 75,000
Information technology services	<u>100,000</u>
Total	\$175,000+

On-Going Staffing-Related Cost Estimates

New City Manager	\$120,000
New Finance Director	94,000
New Zoning/Compliance Officer/ Inspector	60,000
New Human Resources Manager	70,000
New Police Chief	95,000
New Assistant Police Chief	85,000
New Fire Chief	85,000
New Assistant Fire Chief	75,000
New Public Works Director	95,000
New Service Foreman – Streets	80,000
New Maintenance/Service Workers (4)	240,000
On-going legal services	75,000
On-going engineering services	<u>100,000</u>
Total	\$1,214,000

@@ It is possible that these services could be contracted to the proposed merged government from Greene County. It is estimated that the Planning/Zoning services would be the equivalent of one (1) FTE at a minimum contract cost of approximately \$75,000

